

Judge Marsha J. Pechman

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON

ANDREW CHERRY,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE PRUDENTIAL INSURANCE
COMPANY OF AMERICA,

Defendant.

Case No. 2:21-cv-00027-MJP

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action involves and is likely to involve disclosure of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential information under seal. The parties further stipulate that the agreement does not apply to information the parties have obtained through the ordinary course of

1 business or records submitted to or generated by or on behalf of Prudential in adjudicating
2 Plaintiff's claim for LTD benefits and appeals at issue in the case; rather, the agreement extends
3 only to that information, otherwise meeting the definition of "Confidential" materials as
4 described in Paragraph 2, obtained through discovery in the case.
5

6 2. "CONFIDENTIAL" MATERIAL

7 "Confidential" material shall include the following documents and tangible things
8 produced or otherwise exchanged in discovery, which disclose:
9

10 (a) Prudential's proprietary documents, and information, including, but not limited to,
11 policies, practices, procedures, training materials, and claims handling guidelines;

12 (b) Plaintiff's medical records and related personal medical information obtained solely
13 through the course of discovery (i.e., not including those records previously obtained by
14 Prudential in the ordinary course of business or submitted to or generated by or on behalf of
15 Prudential in adjudicating Plaintiff's claim for LTD benefits and appeals);

16 (c) Plaintiff's business, employee, and personal records including but not limited to,
17 Social Security numbers, birth date and birth month, payroll and salary, tax information/returns,
18 investigations, complaints, and/or reports obtained solely through the course of discovery (i.e.,
19 not including the information obtained by Prudential in the ordinary course of business or
20 submitted to or generated by or on behalf of Prudential in adjudicating Plaintiff's claim for LTD
21 benefits and appeals);
22

23 (d) portions or all of deposition testimony and transcripts falling into any of the above
24 categories; and
25
26

(e) portions or all of a party's written interrogatories, requests for admission, and answers and responses thereto falling into categories (a)–(c) above.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

4.1. Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential material must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

4.2. Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may disclose any confidential material only to:

(a) the receiving party's counsel of record in this action, as well as employees of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

1 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the
2 receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties
3 agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney's Eyes Only and is so
4 designated;

5 (c) experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this
6 litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

7 (d) the Court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

8 (e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of
9 confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service
10 instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately
11 return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

12 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
13 reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound"
14 (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the Court. Pages of
15 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must
16 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
17 under this agreement;

18 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
19 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

20 4.3. Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or
21 referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party,
22 in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will
23
24
25
26

1 remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion
2 to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the
3 designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue,
4 and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to sealing
5 the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and
6 the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material
7 under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must satisfy the
8 requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion to seal.
9 Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in accordance with
10 the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.
11

12
13 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

14 5.1. Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party
15 or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take
16 care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate
17 standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material,
18 documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the
19 material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
20 unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.
21

22 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
23 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
24 unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary
25 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.
26

1 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated
 2 for protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other
 3 parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

4 5.2. Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
 5 agreement (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or
 6 ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must
 7 be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.
 8

9 (a) Information in documentary form: (e.g., paper or electronic documents and
 10 deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings),
 11 the designating party must affix the word "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains
 12 confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection,
 13 the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
 14 markings in the margins).
 15

16 (b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties
 17 and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other pretrial
 18 proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony
 19 after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after receiving the
 20 transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the transcript, or
 21 exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect confidential information
 22 at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.
 23

24 (c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place
 25 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word
 26

1 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection,
 2 the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

3 5.3. Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
 4 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party’s
 5 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a
 6 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated
 7 in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.
 8

9 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

10 6.1. Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of
 11 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party’s confidentiality
 12 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
 13 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to
 14 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
 15 original designation is disclosed.
 16

17 6.2. Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute
 18 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding confidential
 19 designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in a declaration
 20 or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference with other
 21 affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification must list
 22 the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires a face-
 23 to-face meeting or a telephone conference.
 24
 25
 26

6.3. Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without Court intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Local Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain the material in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that party must:

- (a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
- (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and
- (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized

disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this agreement, and (d) request that such person or persons execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS

Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts and summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of destruction.

Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all documents filed with the Court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2 DATED: September 2, 2021 /s/ Jesse Cowell
3 Jesse Cowell, WSBA #50725\
4 jesse@roylawgroup.com
5 ROY LAW GROUP
6 Attorneys for Plaintiff

7 DATED: September 2, 2021 /s/ Ian H. Morrison
8 Ian H. Morrison (pro hac vice)
9 imorrison@seyfarth.com
10 SEYFARTH SHAW LLP
11 Attorney for Defendant

12 DATED: September 2, 2021 /s/ Lauren Parris Watts
13 Lauren Parris Watts, WSBA #44064
14 lpwatts@seyfarth.com
15 SEYFARTH SHAW LLP
16 Attorney for Defendant

17 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED

18 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any
19 documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal
20 or state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to
21 those documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or
22 any other privilege or protection recognized by law.

23 Dated: September 7, 2021

24 

25 Marsha J. Pechman
26 United States Senior District Judge

EXHIBIT A**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of
 perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
 issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on [date] in the
 case of Andrew Cherry v. The Prudential Insurance Company of America, Case No. 2:21-cv-
 00027-MJP. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective
 Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions
 and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner
 any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity
 except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
 Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective
 Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____